IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA WESTERN DIVISION No. 5:22-cv-00068-BO

YOLANDA IRVING, et al.,)
Plaintiffs,)
	RENEWED
V.	MOTION TO DISMISS
) EMANCIPATE NC, INC.
THE CITY OF RALEIGH, et al.,)
)
Defendants.)

Defendants City of Raleigh, Chief of Police Estella Patterson in her official capacity, and City Manager Marchell Adams-David in her official capacity (collectively the "City"), pursuant to Rule 12(b)(1) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, respectfully renew the motion to dismiss previously filed in this action [DE 59] and move the Court to dismiss Emancipate NC, Inc. ("Emancipate") as a Plaintiff in this action, on the grounds that Emancipate lacks standing to bring the claims asserted in the Second Amended Complaint. In support of this motion, the City shows the following:

- 1. The factual allegations establish that Emancipate, as an organization, has not suffered an injury in fact that is fairly traceable to Defendants' alleged misconduct or that is likely redressable by a favorable decision.
- 2. Rather, the factual allegations show that Emancipate elected to engage in a variety of activities to pursue its broad mission to end mass incarceration and racism in the legal system independent of circumstances at issue in this case.

- 3. Emancipate's interest in this litigation is no more than an attempt to vindicate its preferences through the judicial system, which falls short of the injury in fact required to confer standing under Article III.
- 4. The City has specifically renewed its motion and seeks to dismiss as Emancipate's claims under the Second Amended Complaint.
- 5. In support of this Renewed Motion and in the interest of judicial economy, the City relies on the pleadings filed to date, and, in lieu of an accompanying supporting memorandum, its Memorandum in Support of its original motion to dismiss [DE 60]. The City will subsequently file a Reply.
- 6. The allegations concerning Emancipate have not changed. The same allegations made in the first Amended Complaint appear in the Second Amended Complaint. The City's arguments apply to the same extent after the amendment as they did before it.
- 7. The Court possesses the discretion to evaluate the City's original motion to dismiss in light of the facts alleged in the Second Amended Complaint. *See Pettaway v. Nat'l Recovery Sols., LLC*, 955 F.3d 299, 303-04 (2d Cir. 2000); *Paragon Mgmt., LLC v. Epic Aviation, LLC*, No. 1:20-cv-01407, 2021 WL 3852109, at *2 (E.D. Va. Aug. 27, 2021).
- 8. Under either approach, Emancipate should be dismissed from this action pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1).

WHEREFORE, the City respectfully requests that the Court dismiss Emancipate as a Plaintiff and grant any other further relief it deems proper and just.

Respectfully submitted,

This the 14th day of September 2022.

CITY OF RALEIGH Robin L. Tatum, City Attorney

By: /s/ Dorothy V. Kibler

DOROTHY V. KIBLER Deputy City Attorney N.C. Bar No. 13751

By: /s/ Amy C. Petty

AMY C. PETTY

Senior Associate City Attorney

N.C. Bar No. 20894

PO Box 590

Raleigh, NC 27602 Tel: (919) 996-6560 Fax: (919) 996-7021

Dorothy.Kibler@raleighnc.gov Amy.Petty@raleighnc.gov

Counsel for City of Raleigh, Police Chief Police Estella Patterson in her official capacity, and City Manager Marchell Adams-David in her official

capacity

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA WESTERN DIVISION No. 5:22-cv-00068-BO

YOLANDA IRVING, et al.,)
Plaintiffs,)
V.) CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
THE CITY OF RALEIGH, et al.,)
Defendants.)

I hereby certify that on September 14, 2022, I electronically filed the foregoing **RENEWED MOTION TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF EMANCIPATE NC, INC.** with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which sends notification of such filing to all counsel of record as follows:

Abraham Rubert-Schewel
Tin Fulton Walker & Owen, PLLC
119 E. Main Street
Durham, NC 27701
schewel@tinfulton.com
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Emily Gladden
Tin Fulton Walker & Owen, PLLC
204 N. Person Street
Raleigh, NC 27601
egladden@tinfulton.com
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Michael Littlejohn, Jr. Littlejohn Law, PLLC PO Box 16661 Charlotte, NC 28297 mll@littlejohn-law.com Counsel for Plaintiffs Jason Benton
Parker Poe Admads & Bernstein, LLP
620 South Tyson Street, Suite 800
Charlotte, NC 28202
jasonbenton@parkerpoe.com
Counsel for Defendant Abdullah

Rodney Pettey Samuel Thompson, Jr. Yates McLamb & Weyher, LLP PO Box 2889 Raleigh, NC 27602 Counsel for Defendants Monroe, Rattelade, and Gay

Norwood Blanchard, III Crossley McIntosh Collier, & Edes, PLLC 5002 Randall Parkway Wilmington, NC 28403 norwood@cmclawfirm.com Counsel for Defendant Rolfe Ian Mance
Elizabeth Simpson
Emancipate NC, Inc.
ian@emancipatenc.org
elizabeth@emancipatenc.org
Counsel for Plaintiffs

By: /s/ Amy C. Petty DOROTHY V. KIBLER Deputy City Attorney N.C. Bar No. 13751 AMY C. PETTY Senior Associate City Attorney N.C. Bar No. 20894 PO Box 590 Raleigh, NC 27602 Tel: (919) 996-6560 Fax: (919) 996-7021 Dorothy.Kibler@raleighnc.gov Amy.Petty@raleighnc.gov Counsel for City of Raleigh, Police Chief Estella Patterson in her official capacity, and City Manager Marchell Adams-David in her official capacity